



**THE STATES assembled on Tuesday  
14th September 2010, at 09.30 a.m. under  
the Presidency of the Bailiff,  
Michael Cameron St. John Birt Esquire.**

---

**His Excellency the Lieutenant Governor,  
Lieutenant-General Andrew Peter Ridgway, C.B., C.B.E.,  
was present.**

---

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Connétable Alan Simon Crowcroft of St. Helier – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.59 a.m.)  
Connétable Juliette Gallichan of St. Mary – excused attendance  
Deputy Roy George Le Hérissier of St. Saviour – absent on States business  
Deputy Shona Pitman of St. Helier – ill  
Deputy Kevin Charles Lewis of St. Saviour – absent on States business

---

Prayers

---

### **Withdrawal of lodged propositions**

THE STATES noted that, in accordance with Standing Order 34(1), the proposers of the following propositions lodged “au Greffe” had informed the Greffier of the States that they had been withdrawn –

Draft Annual Business Plan 2011 (P.99/2010): seventh amendment (paragraphs 1–3,  
6–15, 18–22, 25–27, 30–39, 42–46). P.99/2010.  
Lodged: 24th August 2010. Amd.(7)  
*Senator B.E. Shenton.*

Draft Annual Business Plan 2011 (P.99/2010): ninth amendment (paragraph 2). P.99/2010.  
Lodged: 27th August 2010. Amd.(9)  
*Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel.*

### **Draft Annual Business Plan 2011 P.99/2010**

THE STATES commenced consideration of paragraph (a) of a proposition of the Chief Minister concerning the Draft Annual Business Plan 2011 and rejected an amendment of the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel (Amendment 9, paragraph 1), that after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“, except that the proposed total net revenue expenditure of £652,881,000 shall be reduced to £647,881,000 and that the net revenue expenditure of **the ministerial departments as set out in the said Summary Table A** shall be reduced on a pro-rata basis to achieve this £5,000,000 reduction as shown in the Summary Table A amended for Ministerial Departments (excluding Grant to the Overseas Aid Commission and Central Allocations for Treasury and Resources) set out below –

**Summary Table A amended for Ministerial Departments (excluding Grant to the Overseas Aid Commission and Central Allocations for Treasury and Resources)**

<b>States Funded Bodies</b>	<b>2011 Revised Gross Revenue Expenditure</b>	<b>2011 Income Allocation</b>	<b>2011 Revised Net Expenditure Allocation</b>
	<b>£</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>£</b>
<u>Ministerial Departments</u>			
Chief Minister	5,545,841	(493,000)	5,052,841
Economic Development	17,424,680	(1,475,000)	15,949,680
Education Sport and Culture	116,199,606	(16,904,000)	99,295,606
Health and Social Services	186,373,798	(20,118,000)	166,255,798
Home Affairs	49,670,364	(1,706,000)	47,964,364
Housing	17,127,883	(38,184,000)	(21,056,117)
Planning & Environment	10,316,435	(3,644,000)	6,672,435
Social Security	176,958,673	(3,335,000)	173,623,673
Transport and Technical Services	46,687,501	(18,602,000)	28,085,501
Treasury & Resources (Dept alloc.)	47,399,219	(7,712,000)	39,687,219
<b>TOTALS FOR THESE MINISTERIAL DEPARTMENTS</b>	<b>673,704,000</b>	<b>(112,173,000)</b>	<b>561,531,000</b>

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 23**

Senator B.E. Shenton  
 Senator J.L. Perchard  
 Senator A. Breckon  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)

**CONTRE: 25**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator F.E. Cohen  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)

THE STATES commenced consideration of an amendment of the Deputy of St. Mary (Amendment 13, paragraph 1), that in paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2011, after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the **Chief Minister’s Department** shall be increased by –

- (a) £24,000 in order to maintain the ability of the Law Draftsman’s Department to recruit as required, and not proceed with the Comprehensive Spending Review proposal on page 62 of the Plan CMD-S4 “Reduce recruitment budget for the Law Draftsman” and;
- (b) £26,700 in order to maintain the budget for the Legislation Advisory Panel, and not proceed with the Comprehensive Spending Review proposal on page 62 of the Plan CMD-S5 “Reduce the Legal (*sic*) Advisory Panel budget”,

and the net revenue expenditure of the Treasury and Resources Department shall be decreased by the same amount by reducing the allocation for Restructuring Costs.”.

THE STATES, following discussion, granted leave to the Deputy of St. Mary to withdraw his amendment (Amendment 13, paragraph 1) to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2011.

THE STATES commenced consideration of an amendment of the Deputy of St. Mary (Amendment 13, paragraph 2) that in paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2011, after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the **Economic Development Department** shall be increased by £204,000 in order to maintain the normal functioning of the Department and not proceed with the Comprehensive Spending Review proposal on page 62 of the Plan ED-S3 “Overheads – Efficiency Savings” and the net revenue expenditure of the Treasury and Resources Department shall be decreased by the same amount by reducing the allocation for Restructuring Costs.”.

THE STATES, following discussion, granted leave to the Deputy of St. Mary to withdraw his amendment (Amendment 13, paragraph 2) to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2011.

THE STATES rejected an amendment of the Deputy of St. Mary (Amendment 15, paragraph 1), that in paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2011, after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the **Economic Development Department** shall be increased by £175,000 in order to maintain the level of support for tourism marketing and PR and not proceed with the Comprehensive Spending Review proposal on page 62 of the Plan ED-S5 “Reduction in funding for Route Development, destination marketing and PR” and the net revenue expenditure of the Treasury and Resources Department shall be decreased by the same amount by reducing the allocation for Restructuring Costs.”

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 10**

Senator A. Breckon  
Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
Deputy of St. Mary  
Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)  
Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

**CONTRE: 37**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
Senator P.F. Routier  
Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
Senator B.E. Shenton  
Senator F.E. Cohen  
Senator J.L. Perchard  
Senator S.C. Ferguson  
Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
Connétable of St. Ouen  
Connétable of St. Helier  
Connétable of Trinity  
Connétable of Grouville  
Connétable of St. Brelade  
Connétable of St. Martin  
Connétable of St. John  
Connétable of St. Saviour  
Connétable of St. Clement  
Connétable of St. Peter  
Connétable of St. Lawrence  
Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
Deputy of St. Martin  
Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
Deputy of St. Ouen  
Deputy of St. Peter  
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
Deputy of Trinity  
Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
Deputy of St. John  
Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

THE STATES rejected an amendment of the Deputy of St. Mary (Amendment 15, paragraph 2), that in paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2011, after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the **Economic Development Department** shall be increased by £500,000 in order to allow the department to promote the island more effectively”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 8**

Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

**CONTRE: 39**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator B.E. Shenton  
 Senator F.E. Cohen  
 Senator J.L. Perchard  
 Senator A. Breckon  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F.du H. Le Gresley  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

THE STATES commenced consideration of an amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier (Amendment 4, paragraph 1) to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2011, that after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the **Economic Development Department** shall be increased by –

- (a) £138,000 in order to maintain the level of support for tourism events and not proceed with the Comprehensive Spending Review proposal on page 62 of the Plan ED-S6 “Reduction in grants to events” and;
- (b) £36,000 in order to maintain service levels in Jersey Tourism Visitor Services and not proceed with the Comprehensive Spending Review proposal on page 62 of the Plan ED-S7 “Reduced opening hours in Jersey Tourism Visitor Services reception”,

and the net revenue expenditure of the Treasury and Resources Department shall be decreased by the same amount by reducing the allocation for Restructuring Costs.”

THE STATES, following discussion, granted leave to Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier to withdraw paragraph (b) of his amendment (Amendment 4, paragraph 1) to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2011.

THE STATES rejected an amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier (Amendment 4, paragraph 1 as amended) to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2011, that after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the **Economic Development Department** shall be increased by –

- (a) £138,000 in order to maintain the level of support for tourism events and not proceed with the Comprehensive Spending Review proposal on page 62 of the Plan ED-S6 “Reduction in grants to events” and the net revenue expenditure of the Treasury and Resources Department shall be decreased by the same amount by reducing the allocation for Restructuring Costs.”

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 12**

Senator A. Breckon  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

**CONTRE: 32**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator B.E. Shenton  
 Senator F.E. Cohen  
 Senator J.L. Perchard  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Deputy of St. Ouen  
Deputy of St. Peter  
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
Deputy of Trinity  
Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
Deputy of St. John  
Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)

In accordance with Standing Order 106(1)(b) Deputy Jeremy Martin Maçon of St. Saviour declared an interest but remained in the Chamber for the duration of the debate.

THE STATES commenced consideration of an amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier (Amendment 4, paragraph 3) to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2011, that after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2011” there should be inserted the words –

After the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the **Economic Development Department** shall be increased by £183,000 in order to maintain support for the provision of school milk and not proceed with the Comprehensive Spending Review proposal on page 62 of the Plan EDS-13 “Cease funding to subsidise the provision of school milk” and the net revenue expenditure of the Treasury and Resources Department shall be decreased by the same amount by reducing the allocation for Restructuring Costs.”.

Senator James Leslie Perchard declared an interest and withdrew from the Chamber during consideration of the amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier (Amendment 4, paragraph 3) to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2011 (P.99/2010).

### **Changes in Presidency**

The Bailiff retired from the Chamber during consideration of the amendment of the Deputy of St. Mary (Amendment 13, paragraph 1) to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2011 (P.99/2010) and the meeting continued under the presidency of Mr. Michael Nelson de la Haye, Greffier of the States. The Bailiff resumed the presidency during the consideration of the amendment of the Deputy of St. Mary (Amendment 15, paragraphs 1 and 2) to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2011 (P.99/2010).

### **Adjournment**

THE STATES adjourned, having agreed to reconvene on Wednesday 15th September 2010 to continue consideration of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2011 (P.99/2010) and the outstanding items of public business.

THE STATES rose at 6.35 p.m.

**M.N. DE LA HAYE**

*Greffier of the States*